RESOLVING RESISTANCE TO REINFORCEMENT

Heather Horton, Ph.D.
University of Missouri

WHAT ARE YOUR GOALS & QUESTIONS?

- What are the counter-arguments?
- How do you approach people who resist reinforcement?
- How do I get people on board without being too preachy?
- What is the current research?
- Current research v. older research?
- From the district level, how do you support building and classroom implementation?
- Tools for kids with the highest needs?

OBJECTIVES

- Trace the development of resistance to reinforcement
- Define reinforcement
- Analyze the arguments for and against reinforcement
- Articulate response to resistance to reinforcement
HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

The effects of reinforcement have been studied for more than a century (Kennedy & Willcutt, 1964). The effects of reinforcement are studied in the context of operant conditioning and cognitive evaluative theory (Carton, 1996). The variable findings have led to controversy regarding the use of reinforcement (Maag, 2001).

FROM THE LITERATURE

Support
- Significant empirical support (Maag, 2001)
- Reinforcement is misunderstood (Maag, 2001)
- Reinforcement is naturally occurring (Maag, 2001)
- Plan for positive outcomes (Maag, 2001)
- Reinforcement can enhance intrinsic motivation (Cameron & Pierce, 1994)
- Flaws in methodology may be responsible for the evidence against reinforcement (Kohn, 2001)

Opposition
- Punishment is easier to administer (Maag, 2001)
- Punishment works for many students (Maag, 2001)
- Reinforcement deters students (Axelrod, 1996; Maag, 2001)
- Reinforcement undermines intrinsic motivation (Kohn, 2001)
- Reinforcement reduces achievement (Kohn, 2001)
- Reinforcement contradicts popular views of developmental psychology (Axelrod, 1996; Maag, 2001)

OPERANT CONDITIONING THEORY

![Rat pressing lever for food](image)
THE ABC MODEL

CONSEQUENCE

REINFORCER

GETTING TECHNICAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Consequence</th>
<th>Reinforcer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Any stimulus presented contingent on a particular response.”</td>
<td>“A consequent stimulus [P] that increases or maintains the future rate or probability of occurrence of a behavior.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Alberto & Troutman, 2013
PUT ANOTHER WAY...

BEYOND OPERANT CONDITIONING

SELF DETERMINATION THEORY
GETTING TECHNICAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amotivation</td>
<td>&quot;...no impetus or inspiration to act&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extrinsic Motivation</td>
<td>&quot;...doing something because it leads to a separable outcome&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrinsic Motivation</td>
<td>&quot;...doing something because it is inherently interesting or enjoyable&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ryan & Deci, 2000

INTRINSIC MOTIVATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Antecedents</th>
<th>Consequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promote</td>
<td>• Optimal challenges</td>
<td>• Positive specific performance feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undermine</td>
<td>• Threats</td>
<td>• Tangible rewards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Deadlines</td>
<td>• Evaluative feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Directives</td>
<td>• Competition pressure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HOWEVER. . .

“Frankly speaking, because many of the tasks that educators want their students to perform are not inherently interesting or enjoyable, knowing how to promote more active and volitional (versus passive and controlling) forms of extrinsic motivation becomes an essential strategy for successful teaching (Ryan & Deci, 2000).”
SELF DETERMINATION THEORY

Self Regulation

Types of Regulation

- **External**: Behaviors are performed to satisfy an external demand or obtain an externally imposed reward contingency.
- **Introjected**: People perform such actions with the feeling of pressure in order to avoid guilt or anxiety or to attain ego-enhancements or pride.
- **Identified**: "...the person has identified with the personal importance of a behavior and has thus accepted its regulation as his or her own." (Ryan & Deci, 2000)
- **Integrated**: "...occurs when identified regulations have been fully assimilated to the self." (Ryan & Deci, 2000)

CONTINUUM OF REINFORCERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>No Incentive</th>
<th>Low Incentive</th>
<th>Medium Incentive</th>
<th>High Incentive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No Incentive</td>
<td>No Incentive</td>
<td>No Incentive</td>
<td>No Incentive</td>
<td>No Incentive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Incentive</td>
<td>Low Incentive</td>
<td>Low Incentive</td>
<td>Low Incentive</td>
<td>Low Incentive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Incentive</td>
<td>Medium Incentive</td>
<td>Medium Incentive</td>
<td>Medium Incentive</td>
<td>Medium Incentive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Incentive</td>
<td>High Incentive</td>
<td>High Incentive</td>
<td>High Incentive</td>
<td>High Incentive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6/16/2016
RESOLVING RESISTANCE

Provide education
Manipulate topography
Facilitate internal regulation and intrinsic motivation
Encourage high fidelity implementation

REFERENCES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Overall Concept</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reinforcer</td>
<td>Consequences</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Keywords
- **Positive**: positive, immediate, motivation, desirable, praise, consistency, repetition, frequency, attention
- **Negative**: negative
- **Immediate**: immediate
- **Motivation**: motivation
- **Desirable**: desirable
- **Praise**: praise
- **Consistency**: consistency
- **Repetition**: repetition
- **Frequency**: frequency
- **Attention**: attention

### Always Present
- **Frequency**: frequency
- **Ratio/Interval**: ratio/interval
- **Reinforcement**: reinforcement
- **Increasing Behavior**: increasing behavior
- **Support**: support

### Sometimes Present
- **Positive**: positive
- **Negative**: negative
- **Immediate**: immediate
- **Motivation**: motivation
- **Desirable**: desirable
- **Praise/Acknowledgement**: praise/acknowledgement
- **Consistency**: consistency
- **Repeated**: repeated
- **Continuous**: continuous
- **Variable**: variable
- **Fixed**: fixed
- **Attention**: attention
- **Contingent**: contingent
- **Personal/Currency**: personal / currency
- **Dependence**: dependence
- **Reward**: reward
- **Ownership**: ownership
- **Tangible**: tangible
- **Unfair/Special Treatment**: unfair / special treatment
- **Unsustainable**: unsustainable
- **Expensive**: expensive
- **Unnecessary**: unnecessary
- **Time Consuming**: time consuming
- **Ratio**: ratio
- **Interval**: interval
- **4:1**: 4:1
- **Unrealistic**: unrealistic

### Never Present
- **Bribe**: bribe

### Examples and Nonexamples

#### Examples

#### Nonexamples

#### New Example

#### Tie Down a Definition
### Key Topic
Extrinsic Motivation & Reinforcement Strategies

is about...

Designing a continuum of reinforcers that scaffolds students’ self-regulation from external to integrated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Idea</th>
<th>Main Idea</th>
<th>Main Idea</th>
<th>Main Idea</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External</td>
<td>Introjected</td>
<td>Identified</td>
<td>Integrated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential Details</td>
<td>Essential Details</td>
<td>Essential Details</td>
<td>Essential Details</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**So What? (What’s important to understand about this?)**